

Minutes of Plan Commission Meeting May 21, 2007

Held at the Town Hall on County Highway G

Town of Holland, Sheboygan County, Wisconsin

The numbering of the minutes corresponds to that of the Agenda:

1. The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. The purpose of the meeting was to decide what firm to hire for the Comprehensive Plan.
2. The assembly recited the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. Chairman Becker certified that the requirements of the Wisconsin Open Meetings law had been met.
4. The Agenda was adopted as the official order of business on a motion by Eugene Schmitz. The motion was supported by Jan Rauwerdink and passed by a unanimous voice vote.
5. Roll Call showed in attendance Chairman Donald Becker, Ken Nyhuis, Eugene Schmitz, Dave Huenink, Trevor Mentink, and Jan Rauwerdink. Absent were Claus Weingaertner, John Kucksdorf, David Mueller, and Tom Huenink.
6. Graef, Anhalt, Schloemer & Associates, Inc. gave a 15-minute presentation. Fees are based on time (\$95-110 per hour) and travel (\$0.485/mile, IRS rate).
7. Comprehensive Plan: evaluation of various competing proposals from third party consultants. A projection screen was used to facilitate group collaboration. Everybody had used the scoring sheets previously distributed. Chairman Becker came prepared with Excel evaluation templates for all six proposals, projected onto the screen. Evaluation data from Plan Commission members were inputted in real time into the Excel spreadsheets, displayed on the screen. The results were summary numerical scores (“overall score”) for each of the six firms:

Foth	4.18
Bay-Lake	3.96
OMNNI	3.63
Martenson & Eisle	3.51
Ruekert & Mielke	3.39
MSA	3.06

Discussion of these results ensued. Comparisons were made with individuals' scores. Chairman Becker described his reasoning process for his evaluations. He recommended following up on some of the firms' references at a later meeting and/or an interview with firms. MSA was dropped from further consideration on account of its lowest score. Each Plan Commission member present spoke about his evaluation. Eugene Schmitz liked Bay-Lake. Dave Huenink liked Bay-Lake which did our 1999 plan and other townships in Sheboygan County; which attends meetings at no charge. Ken Nyhuis liked Bay-Lake. Eugene Schmitz liked Foth. Several PC members scored Foth the highest. Dave Huenink noted that Foth stresses the implementation of the Plan; uses existing Sheboygan County maps rather than generating their own. OMNNI: Dave Huenink noted some deficiencies. Don Becker said the proposal was well written but boiler plate. Martenson & Eisle: Dave Huenink noted the concise 50-page size of their Plan; 12-month time frame with 9 meetings; experienced with some nearby towns; uses Sheboygan County maps. Chairman Becker was intrigued by the non-traditional approach; implementation is under separate contract. Jan Rauwerdink noted the diagnostic form in the proposal. Ruekert & Mielke: Donald Becker noted 3 public input meetings with a total of 22 meetings; 12-16 months. Dave Huenink noted serial rather than parallel work process. Eugene Schmitz liked their experience with the City of Port Washington and with boundary agreements.

1st Ballot: 3 yes and 2 no allowed (MSA had dropped out).

Bay-Lake	5 yes, 0 no
Foth	4 yes, 1 no
Martenson & Eisle	2 yes, 3 no
OMNNI	2 yes, 3 no
Rukert-Mielke	2 yes, 3 no

2nd ballot: disregarding Foth and Bay-Lake, because they were clearly favored in the 1st 1 yes and 2 no allowed:

Martenson & Eisle	3 yes, 2 no
OMNNI	3 yes 2 no
Rukert-Mielke	3 yes 2 no

Rukert-Mielke was dropped from further consideration based on its lower overall score, and given the need to narrow down the choices.

Cost data was unsealed:

Omni \$29,356

Foth \$21,500 (mapping services to be done by County not part of cost proposal)

Martenson & Eisle \$27,100 (implementation is a separate contract)

Bay-Lake \$34,933 (noted that extra meetings may have been factored in)

3rd Ballot to decide between Martenson & Eisle and OMNNI:

Martenson & Eisle	2 YES
OMNNI	3 YES

Chairman Becker moved to name Bay-Lake, Foth, and OMNNI as the top three finalists, to invite them to come for interviews in June, and to check their references before that June meeting. The motion was seconded by Jan Rauwerdink and passed by a unanimous roll call vote.

Brainstorming questions to put to the firms' references who will be contacted:

1. Was there a cost over-run?
2. Total number of meetings in line with proposal?
3. How happy were you with them?
4. Why did you choose them?
5. Name one or two of their key strengths that the firm brought that contributed to the success of the project.
6. Availability/accessibility of key project personnel.
7. Did you hold schedule? If not, what caused the slippage?

8. Is there anything we should know about as we consider working with this firm?
 9. Would you choose them again?
 10. What were the one or two key weaknesses observed?
 11. Ask of township references: Which of our list of concerns (7 items) were also concerns for your township?
 12. Do you use your plan? How easy it to use?
 13. Describe the implementation recommendations.
 14. How much did the firm help you? (Specific recommendations and schedule for implementation provided?)
8. Recommendation to board regarding selection of consultant for Comprehensive Plan: The Plan Commission was not prepared to make a recommendation yet. The three finalists will be interviewed (20 minutes each) at the next special meeting of the Plan Commission (June 25, 2007, 7:00 p.m.) and their references will be checked. Chairman Becker will prepare a list of references to be contacted, for follow up by Don Becker, Dave Huenink, and Sydney Rader. Each of these three individuals will interview 1 or 2 references for each of the three consultants being considered for the Comprehensive Plan. Sydney Rader will notify and invite Board members to the June 25 meeting.
9. The meeting adjourned at 10:05 p.m. on a motion by Donald Becker, supported by Eugene Schmitz, passed by a unanimous voice vote.

Respectfully submitted,
Syd Rader, Clerk Plan Commission Town Holland
May 23, 2007